

Report of	Meeting	Date
Chief Executive	Governance Committee	25 <sup>th</sup> January 2017

## **CHANGES TO ARRANGEMENTS FOR APPOINTMENT OF EXTERNAL AUDITORS**

### **PURPOSE OF REPORT**

1. To remind members of the various arrangements available to the Council to appoint its external auditor beyond the 2017/18 financial year when the current contract with Grant Thornton comes to an end. These include setting up an independent auditor appointment panel or opting-into a Sector Led Body (SLB) that will negotiate contracts and make the appointment on behalf of councils.
2. To explain the relative advantages and disadvantages of the various options available.
3. To inform members that Public Sector Audit Appointments Ltd. (PSAA) has been chosen as the SLB by the Secretary of State and that the Council has now received an invitation from PSAA to become an opted-in authority, to which replies must be made by the deadline of 9<sup>th</sup> March 2017.
4. To recommend that the Council becomes an opted-in authority.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

5. That members of the Committee recommend to full Council on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2017 to approve option 3 in the report thereby accepting the invitation from Public Sector Audit Appointments Ltd. to become an opted-in authority for the purposes of the appointment of its external auditor thus dispensing with the need to set up its own appointment panel.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF REPORT**

6. Members have previously been informed that all large local government bodies including Chorley Council remain on current external audit contracts until the completion of the 2017/18 audits but that new appointments will need to be made by 31st December 2017.
7. Therefore in 2017 the Council will need to make a choice between the various options for appointing its external auditor, which in summary are:
  - setting up an independent Auditor Appointment Panel
  - joining with other councils to set up a joint independent Auditor Appointment Panel
  - Using an existing independent panel of the authority (if a suitable panel already exists)
  - opting-in to a SLB that will negotiate contracts and make the appointment on behalf of councils, removing the need to set up an independent Auditor Appointment Panel.

8. Although the Council has until December 2017 to make an appointment, in practical terms this means one of the above options will need to be in place by spring 2017 in order that the contract negotiation process can be carried out during 2017.
9. The Local Government Association (LGA) is strongly supportive of the SLB approach as it believes this offers best value to Councils by reducing set-up costs and having the potential to negotiate lowest fees in order to deliver economic and efficient external audit arrangements across all authorities.
10. As the greatest economies of scale would come from the maximum number of councils acting collectively in opting-in to a SLB, in order to maximise their negotiating position the LGA recently contacted Councils to test their opinion as to whether they would be potentially interested in the SLB approach. Whilst keeping all the Council's options open, the CEO has notified the LGA of the Council's potential support for the SLB.
11. PSAA has subsequently been chosen by the Secretary of State as the SLB and on 27<sup>th</sup> October 2016, Council CEOs received a formal letter from them inviting authorities to opt-in to the sector led approach (**See Appendix**).
12. The length of the compulsory appointing period is the 5 consecutive financial years commencing 1<sup>st</sup> April 2018.
13. A decision to become an opted-in authority must be taken in accordance with the prevailing regulations; that is by the members of an authority meeting as a whole (in the case of Chorley Borough Council).
14. The closing date to notify PSAA of the authority's acceptance of their invitation is 9<sup>th</sup> March 2017.

<b>Confidential report</b> Please bold as appropriate	Yes	<b>No</b>
--	-----	-----------

## CORPORATE PRIORITIES

15. This report relates to the following Strategic Objectives:

Involving residents in improving their local area and equality of access for all		A strong local economy	
Clean, safe and healthy communities		An ambitious council that does more to meet the needs of residents and the local area	<b>X</b>

## **BACKGROUND**

16. The Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 brought the Audit Commission to a close and established transitional arrangements for the appointment of external auditors and the setting of audit fees for all local government and NHS bodies in England. On 5 October 2015 the Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government determined that the transitional arrangements for local government bodies would be extended by one year to also include the audit of the accounts for 2017/18.
17. The Council's current external auditor is Grant Thornton, this appointment having been made under a contract let by the Audit Commission. Following closure of the Audit Commission the contract is currently managed by PSAA, the transitional body set up by the LGA with delegated authority from the Secretary of State.
18. Over recent years the Council has benefited from reduction in fees in the order of 50% compared with historic levels. This has been the result of a combination of factors including new contracts negotiated nationally with the firms of accountants and savings from closure of the Audit Commission.
19. Current fees are based on discounted rates offered by the firms in return for substantial market share. When the contracts were last negotiated nationally by the Audit Commission they covered NHS and local government bodies and offered maximum economies of scale.
20. When the current transitional arrangements come to an end on 31 March 2018 the Council will be able to move to local appointment of the auditor. There are a number of routes by which this can be achieved, each with varying risks and opportunities.
21. The scope of the audit will still be specified nationally, the National Audit Office (NAO) is responsible for writing the Code of Audit Practice which all firms appointed to carry out the Council's audit must follow. Not all accounting firms will be eligible to compete for the work, they will need to demonstrate that they have the required skills and experience and be registered with a Registered Supervising Body approved by the Financial Reporting Council.
22. The registration process has not yet commenced and so the number of firms is not known but it is reasonable to expect that the list of eligible firms may include the top 10 or 12 firms in the country, including our current auditor. It is unlikely that small local independent firms will meet the eligibility criteria.

### **The Options for Local Appointment of External Auditors**

23. There are three broad options open to the Council under the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 (the Act):

#### **Option 1 - To make a stand-alone appointment**

In order to make a stand-alone appointment the Council will need to set up an Auditor Panel. The members of the panel must be wholly or a majority independent members as defined by the Act. Independent members for this purpose are independent appointees, this excludes current and former elected members (or officers) and their close families and friends. This means that elected members will not have a majority input to assessing bids and choosing which firm of accountants to award a contract for the Council's external audit. A new independent auditor panel established by the Council will be responsible for selecting the auditor.

#### *Advantages/benefits*

- Setting up an auditor panel allows the Council to take maximum advantage of the new local appointment regime and have local input to the decision.

#### *Disadvantages/risks*

- Recruitment and servicing of the Auditor Panel, running the bidding exercise and negotiating the contract is estimated by the LGA to cost in the order of £15,000 plus on going expenses and allowances.
- The Council will not be able to take advantage of reduced fees that may be available through joint or national procurement contracts.
- The assessment of bids and decision on awarding contracts will be taken by independent appointees and not solely by elected members.

### **Option 2 - To set up a joint auditor panel / local joint procurement arrangement**

The Act enables the Council to join with other authorities to establish a joint auditor panel. Again this will need to be constituted of wholly or a majority of independent appointees (members). Further legal advice will be required on the exact constitution of such a panel having regard to the obligations of each Council under the Act and the Council need to liaise with other local authorities to assess the appetite for such an arrangement.

#### *Advantages/benefits*

- The costs of setting up the panel, running the bidding exercise and negotiating the contract will be shared across a number of authorities.
- There is greater opportunity for negotiating some economies of scale by being able to offer a larger combined contract value to the firms.

#### *Disadvantages/risks*

- The decision making body will be further removed from local input, with potentially no input from elected members where a wholly independent auditor panel is used or possibly only one elected member representing each Council, depending on the constitution agreed with the other bodies involved.
- The choice of auditor could be complicated where individual Councils have independence issues. An independence issue occurs where the auditor has recently or is currently carrying out work such as consultancy or advisory work for the Council. Where this occurs some auditors may be prevented from being appointed by the terms of their professional standards. There is a risk that if the joint auditor panel choose a firm that is conflicted for this Council then the Council may still need to make a separate appointment with all the attendant costs and loss of economies possible through joint procurement.

### Option 3 – To opt-in to a sector led body

In response to the consultation on the new arrangement the LGA successfully lobbied for Councils to be able to 'opt-in' to a SLB appointed by the Secretary of State under the Act. An SLB would have the ability to negotiate contracts with the firms nationally, maximising the opportunities for the most economic and efficient approach to procurement of external audit on behalf of the whole sector.

#### *Advantages/benefits*

- The costs of setting up the appointment arrangements and negotiating fees would be shared across all opt-in authorities.
- By offering large contract values the firms would be able to offer better rates and lower fees than are likely to result from local negotiation.
- Any conflicts at individual authorities would be managed by the SLB who would have a number of contracted firms to call upon.
- The appointment process would not be ceded to locally appointed independent members. Instead a separate body set up to act in the collective interests of the 'opt-in' authorities. The LGA are setting up such a body utilising the knowledge and experience acquired through the setting up of the transitional arrangements.

#### *Disadvantages/risks*

- Individual elected members will have less opportunity for direct involvement in the appointment process other than through the LGA and/or stakeholder representative groups.
- In order for the SLB to be viable and to be placed in the strongest possible negotiating position the SLB will need Councils to indicate their intention to opt-in before final contract prices are known.

### IMPLICATIONS OF REPORT

24. In the preparation of this report, consideration has been given to the impact of its proposals in all the areas listed below. This report has implications in the following areas and the relevant Directors' comments are included:

Finance	✓	Customer Services	
Human Resources		Equality and Diversity	
Legal	✓	Integrated Impact Assessment required?	
No significant implications in this area		Policy and Communications	

## **COMMENTS OF THE STATUTORY FINANCE OFFICER**

25. Current external audit fees levels are likely to increase when the current contracts end in 2018.
26. The cost of establishing a local or joint Auditor Panel outlined in options 1 and 2 above will need to be estimated and included in the Council's budget for 2017/18. This will include the cost of recruiting independent appointees (members), servicing the Panel, running a bidding and tender evaluation process, letting a contract and paying members fees and allowances.
27. Opting –in to a national SLB provides maximum opportunity to limit the extent of any increases by entering into a large scale collective procurement arrangement and would remove the costs of establishing an auditor panel.

## **COMMENTS OF THE MONITORING OFFICER**

28. Section 7 of the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 (the Act) requires a relevant authority to appoint a local auditor to audit its accounts for a financial year not later than 31 December in the preceding year. Section 8 governs the procedure for appointment including that the authority must consult and take account of the advice of its auditor panel on the selection and appointment of a local auditor. Section 8 provides that where a relevant authority is a local authority operating executive arrangements, the function of appointing a local auditor to audit its accounts is not the responsibility of an executive of the authority under those arrangements.
29. Section 12 makes provision for the failure to appoint a local auditor: the authority must immediately inform the Secretary of State, who may direct the authority to appoint the auditor named in the direction or appoint a local auditor on behalf of the authority.
30. Section 17 gives the Secretary of State the power to make regulations in relation to an 'appointing person' specified by the Secretary of State. This power has been exercised in the Local Audit (Appointing Person) Regulations 2015 (SI 192) and this gives the Secretary of State the ability to enable a Sector Led Body to become the appointing person.

## **GARY HALL CHIEF EXECUTIVE**

There are no background papers to this report.

<b>Report Author</b>	<b>Ext</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Doc ID</b>
Garry Barclay	01772 625272	1/12/16	External Audit Appointment